BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04866 6705

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

CONSTITUTIONAL TEXTS

VOLUME IV

David M. Beatty
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

July 1999

With the assistance of Trevor Knight, Angus Gibbon and Nora Flood.

Storage
K
3165
.A58B42
1999
v.4
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 2 3 1999
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

CONSTITUTIONAL TEXTS

VOLUME IV

David M. Beatty
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

July 1999

With the assistance of Trevor Knight, Angus Gibbon and Nora Flood.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
- VOLUME I - RELIGION -

1. INTRODUCTION: RIGHTS AND RELIGION 1

2. AMERICAN BEGINNINGS 2

Lee v. *Weisman* (1992) 112 S.Ct. 2649; 505 U.S. 577 (USA) 5

Oregon v. *Smith* (1990) 110 S.Ct. 1595; 496 U.S. 913 (USA) 25
Note 39

3. THE GERMAN ALTERNATIVE 49

School Prayer Case (1979) 52 BverfGE 223 (Germany) 50
Note 55

Classroom Crucifix II Case (1995) 93 BverfGE 1 (Germany) 58
Note 67

Blood Transfusion Case (1971) 32 BverfGE 98 (Germany) 70
Note 73

4. FREEDOM FROM ACTIVITIES AND IDEAS THAT ARE ANTITHETICAL TO ONE'S RELIGIOUS BELIEFS 80

Religious Ceremonies & Displays 80
Japan 80

Kakunaga v. *Sekiguchi* (1977) (The *Shinto Groundbreaking Ceremony* Case) (Japan) 81
Note 92

Japan v. *Nakaya* (1988) (The *Serviceman Enshrinement* Case) (Japan) 96
Note 103

Secular Ideas 108
European Court of Human Rights 108

Kjeldsen, Busk Madsen & Pedersen v. *Denmark* (1976) 1 E.H.R.R. 711

(EurCtHR) 109
Note 115

Valsamis v. *Greece* (1996) 24 E.H.R.R. (EurCtHR) 116
Note 121

Supreme Court of India 124

Bijoe Emmanuel v. *State of Kerala*, AIR 1987 S.C. 748 (India) 124
Note 129

Sabbatarian Laws 131

Lior Horev v. *Minister Communication/Transportation*, (Israel) 131
Note 148

S v. *Lawrence*; *S* v. *Negal*; *S* v. *Solberg* (1997) (South Africa) 156
Note 171

5. FREEDOM TO ENGAGE IN PRACTICES THAT ARE A PART OF ONE'S RELIGIOUS BELIEFS 174

Blood Transfusions 174

B. (R.) v. *Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto* (1995) 122 D.L.R. (4th) 1 (Canada) 176

Re J (An Infant); B and B v. *Director General of Social Welfare* [1996] 2 N.Z.L.R. 134 (New Zealand) 183
Note 187

Amezqueta v. *Health Service of Navarre* (Spain) 189

Hoffman v. *Austria* (1993) 17 E.H.R.R. 292 (EurCtHR) 195

Proselytizing 203

Chan Hiang Leng Colin and others v. *Minister for Information and the Arts* (1997) 2 BHRC 129 (Singapore) 206

Rev. Stanislaus v. *State* (Madhya Pradesh), AIR 1977 S.C. 908 (India) 208
Note 211

6. STATE FUNDING 213

Positive Duties 213

In re Gauteng School Education Bill (1996) 3 S.A. 165 (South Africa) 214
Note 221

9.5 Interdenominational School Case (1975) 41 BverfGE 29 (Germany) 222
Note 225

Adler v. *Ontario* (1996) 140 D.L.R. (4th) 385 (Canada) 226
Note 247
Note 250

Permitted or Proscribed 251

A.G. (Victoria) Ex rel. Black v. *CTH* (1981) 55 A.L.J.R. 154 (Australia) 252

Agostini v. *Felton* (1997) 117 S. Ct. 1997: 521 U.S. 203 (USA) 266
Note 276

St. Stephen's College v. *University of New Delhi*
(1991) Supp 3 S.C.R. 121 (India) 280
Note 289

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/comparativeconst04beat

TABLE OF CONTENTS
- VOLUME II - EQUALITY -

A. GENDER 1

United States v. *Virginia*, 116 S. Ct. 2264 (1996) 1

Alice Miller v. *Minister of Defence*, (195) 49 (iv) P.D. 94 10

Nocturnal Employment Case, 85 BverfGE 191 (1992). (Translation from David Currie, *Comparative Constitutional Law*, School of Law at the University of Chicago) 19

Nissan Motors Inc. v. *Nakamoto* (The *Nissan Gender Discrimination case* in Beer & Itoh, The Constitutional Case Law of Japan 1970-1990. University of Washington Press, 1996) 24

Atam Prakash v. *State of Haryana*, AIR 1986 S.C. 859 25

Van Raalte v. *Netherlands*, EurCtHR #108/1995/614/702 (January 28, 1997) . . 31

Petrovic v. *Austria*, EurCtHR #156/1996/775/976 (February 28, 1998) 33

R. v. *Hess*; *R.* v. *Nguyen*, [1990] 6 W.W.R. 289 37

President of the Republic of South Africa and another v. *Hugo*, (1997) 6 BCLR 759; (1997) 4 S.A. 1 49

B. SEXUAL ORIENTATION 79

The Homosexuality Case in Murphy, Walter F. & Tannenhaus, Joseph, *Comparative Constitutional Law: Cases and Commentaries* (St. Martin's Press, 1977) 79

Dudgeon v. *United Kingdom*, (1981) 4 E.H.R.R. 149 (EurCtHR) 83

Norris v. *A.G. (Ireland)*, [1984] I.R. 36 92

Norris v. *Ireland* (1989) 13 E.H.R.R. 186 (EurCtHR) 102

The National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality v. *Minister of Justice (South Africa)*, Counstitutional Court of South Africa (1998) 104

Roy Romer et al. V. *Richard G. Evans et al.*, (1996) 64 L.W. 4353 125

Quilter v. *Attorney General (New Zealand)*, [1997] 3 BHRC 461 132

Lisa Jacqueline Grant v. *South-West Trains Ltd.*, European Court of Justice #C-249/96 (February 17, 1998) 146

El-Al Israel v. *Danilowitz*, Supreme Court of Israel (May 4, 1994) 151

M v. *H* (1999) 171 D.L.R. (4th) 577 165

Law on Marriage and Family, Dec. No. 14/1995 (III.13) AB Resolution (Hungary) 197

Toonen v. *Australia*, (United Nations Human Rights Committee) Communication No. 488/1992: Australia. 04/04/94.CCPR/C/50/D/488/1992. (March 3, 1992) 202

TABLE OF CONTENTS
- VOLUME III - SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC RIGHTS -

I THE RIGHT TO WORK 1

Lochner v. *New York*, 198 U.S. 45 (1905) 1

Williamson v. *Lee Optical Co.*, 348 U.S. 483 (1955) 15

Marushin Industries Inc. v. *Japan* (The Osaka Small Business Restraint Case) 26 Keishū 9 p.586; S.C. (1972) 18

Sumiyoshi, Inc. v. *Governor, Hiroshima Prefecture* (The Hiroshima Pharmacy Location Case) 29 Minshū 4 p.572; S.C. (1975) 22

Taxi Regulation Case, Dec. No. 21/1994 (Constitutional Court of Hungary) . . . 36

Mohd. Hanif Quareshi et al. v. *State of Bihar*, AIR 1958 S.C. 731 45

Sigurjónsson v. *Iceland* (1993) 16 E.H.R.R. 462 (EurCtHR) 59

Law Society of Alberta v. *Black et al.*, 58 D.L.R. (4th) 317 (1989) 65

II HEALTH 78

Eldridge et al. v. *Attorney General of British Columbia et al.*, 151 D.L.R. (4th) 577 (1997) 78

Soobramoney v. *Minister of Health (Kwazulu-Natal)*, November 27, 1997 (Constitutional Court of South Africa) 90

Shortland v. *Northland Health Ltd.*, [1998] 1 N.Z.L.R. 433 100

Consumer Education & Resource Centre v. *Union of India*, AIR 1995 S.C. 922 103

Re Employment Equality Bill 1996, S. Ct. Ireland #118/97 (1997) 109

DeShaney v. *Winnebago Cty. Soc. Servs. Dept.*, 489 U.S. 189 (1989) 115

A. v. *United Kingdom*, 27 E.H.R.R. 611 (1998) (EurCtHR) 125

III EDUCATION 127

Plyler v. *Doe*, 457 U.S. 202 (1981) 127

Unni Krishnan v. *State of Andhra Pradesh*, AIR 1993 S.C. 2178, [1993] 1 S.C.R. 594 139

Numerus Clausus Case I (1972) 33 BverfGE 303 164

Katō v. *Japan*, 18 Minshū 2343: Supreme Court, 26 February 1964 172

Belgian Linguistic Case (No.2) [1968] E.H.R.R. 252 (EurCtHR) 174

Mahe v. *Alberta*, 68 D.L.R. (4th) 69 (1990) 204

IV WELFARE 222

Olga Tellis v. *Bombay Municipal Corporation*, AIR 1986 S.C. 180 222

Saenz v. *Roe*, 119 S.Ct. 1518 (1999) 229

Tétreault-Gadoury v. *Canada (Employment & Immigration Commission)*, 81 D.L.R. (4th) 358 (1991) 243

Horiki v. *Governor, Hoyogo Prefecture*, 36 Minshū 7 p.1235; S.C. (1982) . . . 249

Re: Economic Stabilization Act 1995 (1997) 4 E.E.C.R. 64 (Constitutional Court of Hungary) 252

TABLE OF CONTENTS
- VOLUME IV - CONSTITUTIONAL TEXTS -

The Constitution of the United States of America App.-1

The Constitution of Canada App.-3

The Constitution of India App.-10

The Constitution of Japan App.-18

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms . App.-22

The Basic Law of the Federal Republic of Germany App.-28

The Constitution of South Africa App.-31

The Bill of Rights of New Zealand App.-36

The Basic Law of Israel App.-37

The Constitution of Hungary App.-38

The Constitution of Ireland App.-41